

Research Article

Convention to characterization: Practices, barriers and facilitating factors in teaching values

Cesar Chester Relleve

Curriculum Implementation Division, SDO Dasmariñas City, Department of Education (DepEd), Philippines (ORCID: [0000-0003-4920-5106](https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4920-5106))

Characterization is the highest level in the taxonomy of the Affective Domain; it is the process of creating a value system that governs learners' conduct, which is the most crucial aspect of their behavior. This study aims to elicit the perceptions of teachers about the attainment, barriers, facilitating factors, and other possible teaching practices that can be used to attain characterization in teaching values. A qualitative data inquiry through an open-ended survey questionnaire was utilized in this study. The following themes emerged from the categorized responses of the eight public school teachers, who are the informants of this study: (1) in the attainment of characterization – values that can be actualized and applied in real life, adherence to curriculum, and teachers as role models; (2) barriers in the characterization are negative societal influence, subject limitation, and learners' disposition; (3) facilitating factors are support and help from family and environment, teacher commitment and competence, and the importance of the subject and its application; (4) other possible teaching practices that can be used are integration in other areas, proper implementation of the curriculum, and active learning. In light of these findings, this study contends that, in the attainment of characterization, the ecological teaching approach could be adopted and sustain the practice of curriculum delivery beyond the conventional cognitive process dimensions.

Keywords: Cognitive domain, Affective domain, Values education, Characterization

Article History: Submitted 3 May 2023; Revised 6 August 2023; Published online 2 December 2023

1. Introduction

As stated in the Department of Education (DepEd) guidelines on classroom assessment, the Cognitive Process Dimensions, which were adapted from Anderson and Krathwohl, may be a useful tool to operationalize the conceptual and developmental progressions reflected in the curriculum's learning standards (DepEd, 2015). Educators and instructional leaders in the K to 12 Basic Education, particularly those in the public schools, were mostly aware of this provision, so their adherence to it is reflected in the lessons and assessments they developed. The taxonomy of Cognitive Development, from Remembering to Creating are plotted in the Table of Specifications (TOS), and test questions are distributed under these dimensions, which sounds like conventional practice in all learning areas, including Values (the current subject nomenclature in Philippine K to 12 Basic Education is *Edukasyon sa Pagpapakatao*). The classification of educational objectives in educational systems is not limited to the cognitive domain; there are two hierarchical models in Bloom's taxonomy that should be emphasized as educators strive to develop learners holistically: the affective and psychomotor domains (Tawalare & Tawalare, 2020). Characterization is the highest level in the taxonomy of the Affective Domain; it is the process of creating a value system that governs learners' conduct, which is the most crucial aspect of their behavior. Thus, in the teaching of Values education, it is also crucial that Affective Domain be operationalized, most importantly to aim for the attainment of Characterization.

Address of Corresponding Author

Cesar Chester Relleve, PhD, Curriculum Implementation Division, SDO Dasmariñas City, Department of Education (DepEd), Philippines.

✉ cesarchester.rellve@deped.gov.ph

How to cite: Relleve, C. C. (2023). Convention to characterization: Practices, barriers and facilitating factors in teaching values. *International Journal of Didactical Studies*, 4(2), 21482. <https://doi.org/10.33902/ijods.202321438>

1.1. Relevance of Values Education

Everyone can spread the idea that values can connect us all, creating a culture where people are seen as human beings with hearts as brothers and sisters, and educational institutions have a crucial role to enact a curriculum-values approach for the holistic development of the learners, which also helps to foster moral leadership by reminding students that knowledge must be applied for the good of society as a whole (Berges Puyo, 2021). Working together to educate, model, and promote the character qualities, moral virtues, civic values, and responsible self-direction that are essential for our shared future is an opportunity for educators, counselors, parents, and youth leaders (Kirschenbaum, 2000).

Teaching values education as early as possible to young learners will make them good people, and schools will prepare them for their roles in the future (Türkoglu, 2019). Values education sought to instill acceptable or suitable behavior in students in order to help them understand cultural standards and expectations (Thornberg & Oğuz, 2013). In order to assure people's overall social and psychological wellbeing, the goal of values education is to develop people with excellent character (Sahin, 2019).

If Values education is introduced at a young age, there will be many more opportunities for future life preparation, personality development, and the development of enduring values (Duban, 2016). The level of moral maturity and human values that students acquired enhanced due to the "Curriculum of Values Education," (Akan, 2021).

Values education has helped students alter their behavior for the better by teaching them important life lessons like honesty, diligence, respect for others, cooperation, compassion, and forgiveness (Shrestha & Gupta, 2019). So, in order for the application and instillation of values in learners' cognitive, psychomotor, and affective aspects the teacher must be aware and understand character education development procedures (Pradana et al., 2021).

1.2. Legal Bases of Values Education in the Philippines

After the peaceful EDSA revolution of 1986, the emergence of opportunities for citizens to take part in social transformation and nation-building, and the new expectations for real freedom and democracy, values education became a top priority in the Philippine educational system, these developments all call for a corresponding re-evaluation of the values, attitudes, and behaviors of the populace (DepEd, 1988). The state wanted to ensure that Filipinos should imbibe values that are imperative for nation building and moral recovery.

Subsequently, former President Fidel V. Ramos issued the Moral Recovery Program through Proclamation No. 62 in 1992, in order to eliminate the societal problems that have plagued Filipinos for decades, such as graft and corruption, crony politics, indifference, inaction, mendicancy, factionalism, and a lack of nationalism (*Proclamation No. 62, s. 1992 | GOVPH, 1992*). In consonance with Proclamation No. 62, Proclamation No. 479 by President Ramos declares that the month of November every year is Filipino Values Month to promote moral awakening and national awareness of human values that are distinctive, sincere, and genuinely Filipino (*Proclamation No. 479, s. 1994 | GOVPH, 1994*).

In 2013, changes in the landscape of Philippine Basic Education happened under the leadership of former President Benigno S. Aquino III, through Republic Act 10533, also known as the Enhanced Basic Education Act, which increases the number of years for basic education, DepEd is also mandated to develop a curriculum that is adherent to this law (*Republic Act No. 10533 | GOVPH, 2013*). Eight learning areas constitute the curriculum from Grades 1 to 10, and the current nomenclature of Values Education is Edukasyon sa Pagpapakatao (EsP) as stated in DepEd Order 31, s. 2012 (DepEd, 2012), in which the learning outcome focuses on students' ability to decide and act for the common good.

Republic Act (RA) 11476, which was signed by former President Rodrigo Duterte, the current Edukasyon sa Pagpapakatao (EsP) subject is replaced with Good Manners and Right Conduct (GMRC) for elementary and Values Education for junior high school as essential subjects in the K-12 curriculum in both public and private schools (*Duterte Signs Law Restoring GMRC, Values Education, 2020*). Although the law is already signed, the Implementing Rules and Regulations (IRR) has not yet been issued, so the current curriculum and nomenclature are being used.

1.3. Revised Blooms Taxonomy and Values Education

The Revised Blooms Taxonomy (RBT) is being used to plan the goals of value education classes, for this will encourage the effective exchange of values using contemporary techniques (Paleeri, 2015). But now that Bloom's cognitive domains are widely and consistently used, it's time for educators to use the affective in conjunction with the cognitive domains (Nelson et al., 2020).

It is necessary to teach in the affective domain because it integrates cognition, behavior, and feelings, teaching in this domain is perhaps the most challenging since it helps students develop their values, ethics, aesthetics, and feelings (Allen & Friedman, 2010). Teaching learners in the affective domain requires strong educational abilities that go beyond the lecture approach, Affective domain approaches work well when educators teach institutional values like mission or philosophy (Neumann & Forsyth, 2008).

1.4. Research Aim

The purpose of this study is to elicit the perceptions of public school teachers who teach *Edukasyon sa Pagpapakatao* or EsP (Values) at the elementary and secondary school levels in the attainment of characterization; specifically, the following questions were sought:

RQ 1) How do the teachers ensure the attainment of characterization?

RQ 2) What are the barriers to the attainment of characterization?

RQ 3) What are the facilitating factors in the attainment of characterization?

RQ 4) What are the other possible teaching practices to attain characterization?

2. Method

2.1. Research Design

This study employed qualitative descriptive research. There are numerous qualitative approaches; however, designs may not be appropriate for research that does not require a highly theoretical setting and seeks to remain true to and depict participant experiences. When straightforward explanations of phenomena are desired, qualitative descriptive investigation is the preferred approach (Sandelowski, 2000).

2.2. Participants

Eight EsP teachers who attended the Integrative Assessment seminar-workshop participated in this study; they were specifically: one Master Teacher, one Head Teacher, and two Classroom Teachers from the Elementary; one Master Teacher, one Head Teacher, and three Classroom Teachers from the Junior High School. All these participants are from the City Schools Division of Dasmariñas, Cavite, Philippines.

2.3. Instrument

The goal of the study was concisely discussed with the participants in a group meeting after explaining and clarifying the open-ended questions floated to them through a Google Form. In the context of qualitative research, when the data are examined for reliability and validity, the objectivity and credibility of the research are evaluated; reliability refers to the data's capacity to be repeated, and validity to integrity and authenticity (Anderson, 2010).

2.4. Data Analysis

Individual answers from each teacher to the open-ended survey were coded, and then these responses were subjected to Thematic Analysis. In analyzing the data, the step-by-step guide by Braun & Clarke (2006), which is not necessarily linear but recursive, was followed in this study: Data familiarization, initial coding, looking for themes, reviewing the themes, naming the themes, and writing the report.

3. Results and Discussion

Attainment, barriers, facilitating factors, and other possibilities for the attainment of characterization in teaching values as perceived by the teachers are presented in Table 1.

Table 1

Attainment of characterization in teaching values

<i>Emerging Themes</i>	<i>Selected Transcript</i>
Values that can be actualized and applied in real life	Giving of examples on situation with appropriate solution that can be used or actualized in life (P3) I incorporate activities that reflects real life scenario (P4) Characterization is attained when it is evident in their day to day living. Children will be able to apply the theories learned in ESP in the daily problem solution & decision- making challenges (P7)
Teachers as role model	As a teacher, I make sure that I lead by example, I give utmost importance on fairness and respect (P4) Always maintain a good, credible image to my students to at least make myself them see that I live by what I teach (P6)

Two themes emerged in the attainment of characterization in teaching values: 1) values that can be actualized and applied in real life; and 2) teachers as role models.

The actualization of theories in real life can be attained through situational examples, reflection on real-life scenarios, and the actual application of theories in solving problems or making decisions in real life. This conforms with the study of Thornberg (2008) that in the teaching and learning process of value education, it should be incorporated into the daily lives of the students, focusing on their behavior.

Leading by example, possessing the values of fairness and respect, and having credibility by walking the talk are of primary importance for the teachers. In order for the teaching of values education to be effective, the values themselves should manifest not only in the teaching but in the teachers themselves (Brady, 2011).

The results regarding the barriers in the attainment characterization in teaching values are presented in Table 2.

Table 2

Barriers in the attainment characterization in teaching values

<i>Emerging Themes</i>	<i>Selected Transcript</i>
Family, social media and other societal influences	Family values/ experiences that differ from what is taught. Lack of values foundation from home (P1) Family and environment, its hard to change habits and attitude especially if they were learned from the family (P2) Pervasive influence of social media..dysfunctional family setup...societal and economic change (P4) Some of the barriers in characterization is the challenging home circumstances of the students..., peer pressure, social media exposures (P5) External factors outside of school control such as: family background, media, state of community values (P6) Barriers, parents cooperation & implementation at home for daily practice (P7)
Limitation of the subject	Insufficient time for each module. Too many subtopics for each module (P1) Short teaching time (P3) Lack of contact time (P6) Not priority like tool subjects (P8)
Learners' disposition	Attitude of students towards activities given to them (P1) Negative belief system (P4) Mental health difficulties (P5)

Barriers to the attainment of characterization include the following: 1) family, social media, and other societal influences, 2) limitation of the subject, and 3) learners' dispositions.

As stated in Yıldırım (2009) study on the teaching of values, education should begin at home, before the school; it should be the parents first; they have the most important responsibility for educating their children. Social media, though virtual, is part of the immediate environment of the students, and though it brought numerous advantages during distance education, especially during the time of the pandemic, without the proper guidance of the students, it may have had a detrimental effect on their behavior. Compared to its benefits, social media has a negative impact on students' conduct (Abbas et al., 2019).

The number of hours allotted for teaching values (Edukasyon sa Pagpapakatao) is two hours per week for junior high school and thirty minutes per day for elementary (DepEd, 2019), which creates a limitation for both teachers and students.

Further, learners' dispositions are one of the barriers to achieving characterization. The belief system, behavioral system, and emotional system are three interconnected personal systems that make up learning dispositions (Larose & Roy, 1995, as cited by Dowd et al., 2019). Students' dispositions should be cultivated in order to increase their capacity to succeed and work at a higher level (Costa & Kallick, 2008).

In addition, results related to facilitating factors in the attainment characterization in teaching values are presented in Table 3. These are the facilitating factors in the attainment of characterization: 1) Support and help from the family and environment; 2) the teachers' commitment and competence; and 3) the importance of the subject and its application.

The family and the most proximate people in a learner's environment play a crucial role in the development of children. The immediate environment has an influence on the acquisition of values (Lakshmi & Paul, 2018). The honing of values and attitudes that are aligned with what the school has been teaching could facilitate characterization.

Table 3

Facilitating factors in the attainment characterization in teaching values

<i>Emerging Themes</i>	<i>Selected Transcript</i>
Support and help from the family and environment	Values starts at home. It should also be inculcated by parents. Should consider the environment of learners at home. Should also integrate parent's supervision or inclusion of values formation (P1) Family , peers, school , church , community are the common contributors that should work hand in hand in influencing, motivating and building character of the students (P5)
Teachers' commitment and competence	Open and spontaneous interaction with students, having a heart for teaching...doing self-reflective activities (P3) Integration of various approaches in teaching (P4) Teachers' commitment, integrity...training of EsP Teachers (P6)
Importance of the subject and its application	Relevance in daily living, application to life (P2) Use of real life scenario and current issues that are relatable to the students (P4) Integration of theories in real life (P7) Prioritize EsP (P8)

The demands on teachers' time grow steadily each year, and this has a negative impact on teachers' ability to perform their responsibilities (Fitriasari & Ummah, 2020). The sustainability of commitment and enhancement of competence are essential in teaching students, not only for the sake of fulfilling teachers' work but also to ensure that learners are going to learn not only the content but the internalization of values as well.

The importance of values and their application in daily lives should be emphasized. There are numerous provisions, including institutional and statutory regulations, highlighting the subject's essentiality. The relevance of the content and its real-life applications should be clearly understood by the students, and teachers should reinforce the internalization of its purposes.

Finally, other results regarding the possible teaching practices to attain characterization are summarized in Table 4.

Table 4

Other possible teaching practices to attain characterization

<i>Emerging Themes</i>	<i>Selected Transcript</i>
Integrative Approach	Integration of values in all learning areas (P3) Integration of ICT in teaching values (P4) Integration of variety of learning strategies, integration of technology and resources in learning delivery (P5) Practice of integration at home at school & at the community (P6)
Alignment in the competencies	Showing real life application of the subject matter or specific topic (P2) Putting premium on the MELCS and values, not just on factual information (P6)
Active learning	More group tasks/ sharings that can help students' realizations about the topic. Story telling of one's experience that would model and inspire students (P1) Experiential Learning, reflective teaching, collaborative teaching (P3)

In other teaching practices that could further facilitate the characterization of values, the following themes emerged: 1) an integrative approach, 2) alignment in the competencies, and 3) active learning.

The teaching of values education should not be limited to the time allotted for the subject, but integration in other learning areas can help in the attainment of characterization. The integration of technology and other teaching strategies were also mentioned by the informants. This is also anchored on the policy guidelines stated in the implementation of the K to 12 Basic Education that one of the pedagogies that should be used is Integrative based on Republic Act 10533, also known as the Enhanced Basic Education Act of 2013 (DepEd, 2019).

In the curriculum guide for basic education, there are three standards highlighted: Content Standards, Performance Standards and Learning Competencies. Currently, the Most Essential Learning Competencies (MELC) are being used (DepEd, 2022). MELC was the result of the revision of the 2016 Curriculum Guide due to the global health crisis caused by the pandemic COVID-19, but still the three standards remain, and clearly these standards do not solely focus on the theoretical aspects of the learning areas but also the application in real life.

4. Conclusion and Recommendations

Based on the study's key findings as a guide, the following conclusions were drawn: Evidently, confining the teaching of values education in the classroom is not sufficient for the attainment of characterization. Family, people, and systems with immediate influence on the learners, the dedication of teachers in teaching, and the students' personal circumstances are interdependent in the internalization of values.

Considering the findings and conclusion, the following are the recommendation presented:

- Standards in the curriculum guide should be strictly adhered to due to their comprehensiveness; they are not only limited in the delivery of cognitive domains.
- Though the focus of the current curriculum competencies is on the most essential, it is still best to consider enabling and enriching competencies if that will help to strengthen the internalization of learning values.
- Intensify the involvement of family, community, and other stakeholders in the teaching and learning activities.
- A divisionwide program that will strengthen characterization in teaching values could be proposed.
- Instructional leaders' guidance, support, and assistance are vital in emphasizing the importance and attainment of characterization in teaching the subject values.

This study contends that, in the attainment of characterization, the ecological teaching approach could be adopted and sustain the practice of curriculum delivery beyond the conventional cognitive process dimension.

Funding: No funding source is reported for this study.

Declaration of interest: No conflict of interest is declared by author.

References

- Abbas, J., Aman, J., Nurunnabi, M., & Bano, S. (2019). The impact of social media on learning behavior for sustainable education: Evidence of students from selected universities in Pakistan. *Sustainability*, 11(6), 1683. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su11061683>
- Akan, Y. (2021). An analysis of the impact of the values education class over the university students' levels of acquisition of moral maturity and human values. *International Journal of Psychology and Educational Studies*, 8(2), 38–50. <https://doi.org/10.52380/ijpes.2021.8.2.294>
- Allen, K. N., & Friedman, B. D. (2010). Affective learning: A taxonomy for teaching social work values. *Journal of Social Work Values and Ethics*, 7(2), 1–12.
- Anderson, C. (2010). Presenting and evaluating qualitative research. *American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education*, 74(8), 141. <https://doi.org/10.5688/aj7408141>
- Berges Puyo, J. G. (2021). A value and character educational model: Repercussions for students, teachers, and families. *Journal of Culture and Values in Education*, 4(1), 100–115. <https://doi.org/10.46303/jcve.2020.7>
- Brady, L. (2011). Teacher values and relationship: Factors in values education. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 36(2). <https://doi.org/10.14221/ajte.2011v36n2.5>
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77–101. <https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa>
- Costa, A. L., & Kallick, B. (Eds.). (2008). *Learning and leading with habits of mind: 16 essential characteristics for success* (Illustrated edition). ASCD.
- DepEd. (1988). The DECS values education program | Department of Education. DepED. <https://www.deped.gov.ph/1988/01/25/do-6-s-1988-the-decs-values-education-program/>
- DepEd. (2012). DO 31, s. 2012 – Policy Guidelines on the Implementation of Grades 1 to 10 of the K to 12 Basic Education Curriculum (BEC) Effective School Year 2012–2013 | Department of Education. <https://www.deped.gov.ph/2012/04/17/do-31-s-2012-policy-guidelines-on-the-implementation-of-grades-1-to-10-of-the-k-to-12-basic-education-curriculum-bec-effective-school-year-2012-2013/>
- DepEd. (2015). April 1, 2015 DO 8, s. 2015 – Policy Guidelines on Classroom Assessment for the K to 12 Basic Education Program | Department of Education. Department of Education - Republic of the Philippines. <https://www.deped.gov.ph/2015/04/01/do-8-s-2015-policy-guidelines-on-classroom-assessment-for-the-k-to-12-basic-education-program/>
- DepEd. (2019). August 22, 2019 DO 021, s. 2019 – Policy Guidelines on the K to 12 Basic Education Program | Department of Education. Department of Education - Republic of the Philippines.

- <https://www.deped.gov.ph/2019/08/22/august-22-2019-do-021-s-2019-policy-guidelines-on-the-k-to-12-basic-education-program/>
- DepEd. (2022). JULY 11, 2022 DO 034, S. 2022 – School Calendar and Activities for the School Year 2022–2023 | Department of Education. Department of Education - Republic of the Philippines. <https://www.deped.gov.ph/2022/07/11/july-11-2022-do-034-s-2022-school-calendar-and-activities-for-the-school-year-2022-2023/>
- Dowd, J. E., Thompson, R. J., Schiff, L., Haas, K., Hohmann, C., Roy, C., Meck, W., Bruno, J., & Reynolds, J. A. (2019). Student learning dispositions: Multidimensional profiles highlight important differences among undergraduate STEM honors thesis writers. *CBE – Life Sciences Education*, 18(2), ar28. <https://doi.org/10.1187/cbe.18-07-0141>
- Duban, N. (2016). Values education from perspectives of classroom teachers. *European Journal of Social Science Education and Research*, 3(3), 80–88. <https://doi.org/10.26417/ejser.v7i1.p80-88>
- Duterte signs law restoring GMRC, values education. (2020, June 26). <https://www.sunstar.com.ph/article/1861476>
- Fitriasari, B., & Ummah, R. (2020). Self-efficacy in terms of work engagement and affective commitment among teachers. *Proceedings of the 5th ASEAN Conference on Psychology, Counselling, and Humanities (ACPCH 2019)*, 74–76. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200120.016>
- Kirschenbaum, H. (2000). From values clarification to character education: A personal journey. *The Journal of Humanistic Counseling, Education and Development*, 39(1), 4–20. <https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2164-490X.2000.tb00088.x>
- Lakshmi, V. V., & Paul, M. M. (2018). Value education in educational institutions and role of teachers in promoting the concept. *International Journal of Educational Science and Research*, 8(4), 29–38.
- Nelson, J. S., Pender, D. A., Myers, C. E., & Sheperis, D. (2020). The effect of affect: Krathwohl and Bloom's affective domains underutilized in counselor education. *Journal of Counselor Preparation and Supervision*, 13(1). <https://digitalcommons.sacredheart.edu/jcps/vol13/iss1/1/>
- Neumann, J. A., & Forsyth, D. (2008). Teaching in the affective domain for institutional values. *Journal of Continuing Education in Nursing*, 39(6), 248–252. <https://doi.org/10.3928/00220124-20080601-07>
- Paleeri, S. (2015). Setting objectives of value education in constructivist approach in the light of Revised Blooms Taxonomy (RBT). *Journal on School Educational Technology*, 10(3), 1–12.
- Pradana, D. A., Mahfud, M., Hermawan, C., & Susanti, H. D. (2021). Nasionalism: Character education orientation in learning development. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute: Humanities and Social Sciences*, 3(4), 4026–4034. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v3i4.1501>
- Proclamation No. 62, s. 1992 | GOVPH. (1992, September 30). Official Gazette of the Republic of the Philippines. <https://www.officialgazette.gov.ph/1992/09/30/proclamation-no-62-s-1992/>
- Proclamation No. 479, s. 1994 | GOVPH. (1994, October 7). <https://www.officialgazette.gov.ph/1994/10/07/proclamation-no-479-s-1994/>
- Republic Act No. 10533 | GOVPH. (2013, May 15). Official Gazette of the Republic of the Philippines. <https://www.officialgazette.gov.ph/2013/05/15/republic-act-no-10533/>
- Sahin, Ü. (2019). Values and values education as perceived by primary school teacher candidates. *International Journal of Progressive Education*, 15(3), 74–90.
- Sandelowski, M. (2000). Whatever happened to qualitative description? *Research in Nursing & Health*, 23(4), 334–340. [https://doi.org/10.1002/1098-240X\(200008\)23:4<334::AID-NUR9>3.0.CO;2-G](https://doi.org/10.1002/1098-240X(200008)23:4<334::AID-NUR9>3.0.CO;2-G)
- Shrestha, B. K., & Gupta, P. (2019). Impact of value education in personal behaviour of students: A case study of Nepal. *Nepal Journal of Multidisciplinary Research*, 2(3), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.3126/njmr.v2i3.26285>
- Tawalare, K., & Tawalare, K. (2020). Bloom's taxonomy and goals of traditional education system insight from Ayurveda. *International Journal of Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, 13(3), 131–133. <https://doi.org/10.15406/ijcam.2020.13.00506>
- Thornberg, R. (2008). The lack of professional knowledge in values education. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 24(7), 1791–1798. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2008.04.004>
- Thornberg, R., & Oğuz, E. (2013). Teachers' views on values education: A qualitative study in Sweden and Turkey. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 59, 49–56. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2013.03.005>
- Türkoglu, B. (2019). Opinions of pre-school teachers and pre-service teachers on values education in the pre-school period: The case of Konya province. *Pegem Journal of Education and Instruction*, 9(2), 381–412.
- Yıldırım, K. (2009). Values education experiences of Turkish class teachers: A phenomenological approach. <http://openaccess.ahievran.edu.tr/xmlui/handle/20.500.12513/1823>